



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday,
25th October 2006 at 9.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Sir Philip Bailhache.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Frank Harrison Walker – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.56 a.m.)
Senator Wendy Kinnard – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.56 a.m.)
Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.56 a.m.)
Senator Terence John Le Main – en défaut (défaut raised at 09.56 a.m.)
Connétable Kenneth Alan Le Brun of St. Mary – en défaut
Connétable Thomas John du Feu of St. Peter – absent due to illness
Deputy Alan Breckon of St. Saviour – absent on States' business
Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.47 a.m.)

Prayers

**Goods and Services Tax: exempt or zero-rated items – P.86/2006
Amendment and Comments**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of Senator Stuart Syvret, proposed as amended by the proposer, the purpose of which was to request the States to agree to vary their decision relating to the introduction in 2008 of a broad-based Goods and Services Tax (GST) at a rate of 3% fixed for 3 years in order to exempt or zero-rate the following items –

- (a) basic foodstuffs;
- (b) medical services and products;
- (c) education fees;
- (d) child care costs;
- (e) *(not proposed)*
- (f) books and newspapers;
- (g) children's clothing;
- (h) domestic energy and fuel.

THE STATES rejected paragraph (a) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) basic foodstuffs.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 17

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

CONTRE: 32

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondre (L)
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES rejected paragraph (b) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) medical services and products.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 20

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

CONTRE: 28

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Helier

ABSTAIN: 1

Deputy of St. John

| | |
|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|
| Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H) | Connétable of Trinity |
| Deputy of Grouville | Connétable of St. Lawrence |
| Deputy of St. Peter | Connétable of Grouville |
| Deputy J.A. Hilton (H) | Connétable of St. John |
| Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H) | Connétable of St. Brelade |
| Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L) | Connétable of St. Martin |
| Deputy of Trinity | Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S) |
| Deputy S. Pitman (H) | Deputy J.J. Huet (H) |
| Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) | Deputy J.B. Fox (H) |
| | Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B) |
| | Deputy of St. Ouen |
| | Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H) |
| | Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondre (L) |
| | Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B) |
| | Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H) |
| | Deputy I.J. Gorst (C) |
| | Deputy of St. Mary |

THE STATES rejected paragraph (c) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) education fees.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 11

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

CONTRE: 35

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

ABSTAIN: 3

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)

Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES rejected paragraph (d) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) child care costs.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 14

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

CONTRE: 35

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondre (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES rejected paragraph (f) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) books and newspapers.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 13

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

CONTRE: 35

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 1

Connétable of St. Brelade

THE STATES rejected paragraph (g) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) children's clothing.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 13

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville

CONTRE: 35

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen

ABSTAIN: 1

Connétable of St. Brelade

Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary

THE STATES rejected paragraph (h) of the proposition requesting them to agree to exempt or zero-rate from Goods and Services Tax (GST) domestic energy and fuel.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 13

Senator S. Syvret
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)
 Deputy C.J. Scott Warren (S)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy D.W. Mezbourian (L)
 Deputy S. Pitman (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

CONTRE: 36

Senator L. Norman
 Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. Mary

In accordance with Standing Orders 106(1)(b) and (c) the following members declared an interest but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate –

Senator Stuart Syvret
 Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur
 Senator Wendy Kinnard
 Senator James Leslie Perchard
 Senator Ben Edward Shenton
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy Celia Joyce Scott Warren of St. Saviour
 Deputy John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré of St. Lawrence.

Fields 190 and 192, Rue de la Sergenté, St. Brelade: petition P.75/2006

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy Sean Power of St. Brelade, requested the Minister for Planning and Environment to refuse to grant permission for the development of Fields 190 and 192, Rue de la Sergenté, St. Brelade, a green field site, at the density and level of development currently proposed.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 28

Deputy C.J. Scott Warren(C)
 Senator L. Norman
 Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains(C)

CONTRE: 3

Senator F.H. Walker
 Senator W. Kinnard
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)

ABSTAIN: 13

Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye(H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy A.J.H. Maclean(H)

Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier(S)
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire(H)
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré(L)
Deputy D.W. Mezbourian(L)
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power(B)
Deputy S. Pitman (H)
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy of St. Mary

Deputy of St. John
Senator P.F. Routier

In accordance with Standing Order 106(1)(a) Deputy Peter Nicholas Troy of St. Brelade declared an interest and withdrew.

In accordance with Standing Orders 106(1)(b) and (c) the Connétable of St. Brelade declared an interest but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

Composting facilities at La Collette, St. Helier: cessation – P.76/2006 Comments

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement requesting the Minister for Transport and Technical Services to cease the composting of all green waste at La Collette, St. Helier, until such time as the composting could be undertaken in a strictly odourless fashion.

In accordance with Standing Order 106(1)(a) Senator James Leslie Perchard declared an interest and withdrew.

Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, and agreed to reconvene on Thursday 26th October 2006 to resume consideration of the proposition of Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement together with the outstanding items of public business.

Changes in Presidency

The Bailiff retired from the Chair following the lunch adjournment, and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States. The Bailiff resumed the Chair prior to consideration of the proposition of Deputy Sean Power of St. Brelade concerning Fields 190 and 192, Rue de la Sergenté, St. Brelade: petition.

The Bailiff retired from the Chair during consideration of the proposition of Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement concerning the composting facilities at La Collette and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States.

THE STATES rose at 5.34 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States